



**FACILITY EVALUATION OF
NORTHERN DOOR CATHOLIC COMMUNITY PARISHES**

**Kevin M. Brunner
Director of Facilities/Properties
Catholic Diocese of Green Bay
September, 2002**

Introduction

During the summer of 2002 Fr. Matt Simonar, pastor of the Northern Door Catholic parishes met with Mark Mogilka, Director of Pastoral Services. In the course of that conversation the topic of planning for the future of the Catholic Community arose. Mr. Mogilka enthusiastically supported and encouraged Fr. Matt in this regard and offered to be of assistance. Mr. Mogilka recommended that as a precursor to any type of a discussion of a planning process, that Kevin Brunner, Diocesan Director of Facilities/Properties be invited to perform a facility assessment of the five parishes that makeup the Northern Door Catholic Community. This report is the result of a visit to the Door County parishes on September 11, 2002 and an evaluation of these parish facilities.

Table of Contents

Parish	Page
St. Mary of the Lake – Baileys Harbor	1
St. John the Baptist – Egg Harbor	3
St. Paul – Fish Creek	5
St. Michael – Jacksonport	6
St. Rosalia – Sister Bay	8

September 11, 2002

Facility Evaluation-St. Mary's of the Lake Parish (Baileys Harbor)

St. Mary's Church and Rectory were both constructed in 1936. Both structures are of Gothic architecture and utilize native limestone for their facades and terra cotta roofs. According to diocesan records, both buildings were built at a total cost of \$50,000.

The parish has maintained both buildings very well. Recent major improvements to the church include an updated heating system (1991), stained glass window repairs (1995), new handicapped lift (1996) and roof repair and tuck-pointing in 1996. The rectory has recently had new roof flashing installed as well as energy efficient replacement windows. The pastor of the Northern Door Catholic Community resides at this location.

According to the pastor, St. Mary's has approximately ¹⁵⁷~~120~~ families. Two masses are celebrated each weekend throughout the year. Attendance at mass increases during the summer/tourist season but the church capacity of approximately ~~275~~ ²⁹⁴⁻³³⁶ is not met very frequently. According to mass statistics maintained by the parish, this church capacity was exceeded only twice during the period February, 2001 through September 1, 2002.

Site

St. Mary's Church and Rectory sit on a bluff overlooking Lake Michigan in the unincorporated township of Bailey's Harbor. Highway 57 lies between the parish buildings and some commercial properties to the east adjacent to Lake Michigan. It is a beautiful location for a church and is probably the most prominent structure in the Baileys Harbor community.

The site is not ideal-the parish property comprises approximately 1.5 acres. It appears it would be difficult to expand the church on this site. There are 60 parking spaces on site with some additional street parking available on both Highway 57 and on the municipal street immediately to the west of the property. A good standard for church parking is one parking stall per 2.5 seats so, ideally, the parish should have approximately 100 parking stalls on site.

Church

The St. Mary's Church is an excellent example of Gothic architecture that was common in American churches constructed in the 1920's and 1930's. Its large exposed wooden trusses along with its Door County limestone exterior are among its significant features.

It is readily apparent that the parish congregation has maintained its church very well over the years. This is evidenced by the strong history of regular maintenance and capital improvements made to the facility by the parish.

There are some accessibility issues with the church building. Restrooms are not directly accessible to the disabled. There are also some problems with liturgical accessibility with steps to the altar. Senior members of the parish might experience some difficulty getting

into the church from the adjacent parking areas due to distance and grade changes. The vertical lift added to the church in 1996 is a plus.

Current church participatory accessibility, liturgical accommodation and sacramental needs are difficult to fully meet in this church. For example, hospitality and fellowship are difficult without a gathering area and the long distance to the rear of the church is not ideal for modern worship (the last pew is approximately 80 feet from the altar-new church design standards recommend that no seating be located further than 60 feet).

The basement of the church functions as a parish hall meeting a variety of parish needs including funeral luncheons, parish dinners and meetings ~~and a food pantry~~. The church basement seems to meet the parish's on-going needs quite well. Future consideration should be made, however, to upgrading the quality of the kitchen appliances and other furnishings to institutional grade. *THE CHURCH BASEMENT AND KITCHEN WERE REMODELED IN 2003.*

Rectory

While I did not have the opportunity to tour the St. Mary's rectory, it appears from the exterior to be in very good condition. Also, from reviewing the maintenance history of this dwelling, the parish has been very vigilant in keeping the rectory in good condition. The mere fact that the pastor has chosen to live at this location is indicative that this rectory is meeting his current and future needs quite well.

The rectory, because of its design and construction materials similar to that of the church, has architectural significance. The rectory also has good potential for adaptive reuse by either the parish or by other parties because of its location and condition should it not continue as a rectory in the future.



CHURCH NAME St. Mary of the Lake City Baileys Harbor

Evaluator Kevin Brunner Date 9/11/02

ARCHITECTURAL BUILDING EVALUATION	RATING	IMPORTANCE FACTOR 1-2-3 HIGH	NOTES
Building(s) Evaluation			Winter 150, Summer - Fall 200. Year -Round 170/157 Families, Summer 250-275 Families
1. Neighborhood	9	2	Municipal Sewer and Water/Good Access
2. Site Size	3	3	Not Ideal Approximately 1.5 - 2 acres
3. Street Parking	6	1	Parking Available to Rear of Church
4. On-Site Parking	3	3	60 - Not Adequate for Capacity of Church
5. Usable Ancillary Buildings			
6. Rectory	9	1	Terra Cotta Roof - New Flashing (Excellent Shape) All New Energy Efficient Windows
7. Convent N/A			
8. Hall/Gym N/A			
9. School N/A			
10. History	10	2	1930-Historically Significant Structure
11. Church (Capacity)	6	3	276 294-336 -Meets Current Needs of Congregation
12. Basement	7	1	Kitchen Needs Updating - Institutional Quality Appliances Needed UPDATED IN 2003
13. ADA Accessibility	4	3	Not Directly Accessible Restroom - Lower Level Wheelchair Elevator Use
14. Condition of Church	8	2	Very Good
15. Architectural Character	10	2	Native Limestone Exterior/Very Prominent Building
16. Addition Potential	3	3	Difficult - Limited
17. Alternate Use Adaptability #	3	2	Difficult
Liturgical Factors			
L1. Participatory Accessibility	5	3	2 Steps to Altar - 75 Feet to Back of Church
L2. Liturgical Accommodation	4	3	
L3. Vatican II Adaptability	4	3	
L4. Sacramental Needs	5	3	Small Sacristy (Not Adequate)
L5. Ministry Needs	5	3	

* Scale 1 to 10 (10 high)
Scale at 10 to 1 (1 high)

Facility Evaluation-St. John the Baptist Parish (Egg Harbor)

St. John the Baptist Church was constructed in 1908. The adjacent rectory which now serves as the parish office for the Northern Door Catholic Community was constructed in 1922.

The parish has maintained both buildings well. The church has been redecorated twice in the last thirty years (1974 and 1992). Recent major improvements to the church include roof replacement (1990), the addition of a gathering area patio in front of the rear church entrance (1997) and repair of the rear wall (1999). Moisture problems that plagued the church rear wall after the 1992 renovation appear to be totally solved by the 1999 improvements.

According to the pastor, St. John the Baptist has membership of approximately 150 families. Two masses are celebrated each weekend throughout the year. Attendance at mass increases during the summer/tourist season and the church capacity of approximately 200 is frequently exceeded during this period of the year. According to mass statistics maintained by the parish, this church capacity was exceeded over 20 times during the period February, 2001 through September 1, 2002. It is rare to not have mass attendance exceeding St. John's church capacity during the summer/early fall.

Site

St. John's Church and Rectory are located on Highway 42 just south of the central business district in the village of Egg Harbor. The parish property includes approximately 9 acres-the largest of the Door County Catholic Community parishes. The parish purchased 5 acres to the east of the church along School Road in 2001 for future parking lot/building expansion.

The site is ideal for a parish the size of St. John's. The site provides ample opportunity for expansion of the current church and parking areas. ~~It is should be noted that the St. John's site is the most centrally located of the five Northern Door parishes with good access to each of the other parishes (all are located within a fifteen minute driving time from St. John's).~~

There are 120 parking spaces on site (plus two handicapped) with some additional street parking available on Highway 42. St. John's has the best on-site parking of the five parishes and easily meets the standard for church parking of one parking stall per 2.5 seats.

Church

Next to St. Michael's in Jacksonport, St. John's Church is the oldest of the five churches evaluated. Even though it will soon observe its centennial, the church structure is in very good condition. Because of its design, age, condition and construction materials, this church has much architectural character and significance.

It is readily apparent that the parish congregation has maintained its church very well over the years. This is evidenced by the strong history of regular maintenance and capital improvements made to the facility by the parish.

There are a number of accessibility issues with the church building. Restrooms are not directly accessible to the disabled and are located in the church basement. There are also some problems with liturgical accessibility with steps to the altar and sanctuary. Senior members of the parish might experience some difficulty getting into the church from the adjacent parking areas due to distance and grade changes.

Current church participatory accessibility, liturgical accommodation and sacramental needs are difficult to fully meet in this church. For example, hospitality and fellowship are difficult without a gathering area although the outdoor patio provides good opportunities for parishioners and visitors to meet and greet each other when weather conditions allow.

The basement of the church functions as a parish hall meeting a variety of parish needs including funeral luncheons, parish dinners and meetings. The church basement seems to meet the parish's on-going needs quite well. The basement restrooms are inadequate and do not meet current code requirements.

Rectory (Parish Offices)

As mentioned previously, the former parish rectory now serves as a parish office for the Northern Door Catholic Community. While it needs some improvements (the roof is in need of repair/replacement, gutters/downspouts should be considered and the interior finishes should be updated), the rectory seems to meet the parish's current office space needs well.

The rectory, because of its age and design, has some architectural significance. The rectory (as well as the church) has good potential for adaptive reuse because of its location.



CHURCH NAME St. John the Baptist City Egg Harbor

Evaluator Kevin Brunner Date 9/11/02

ARCHITECTURAL BUILDING EVALUATION	RATING	IMPORTANCE FACTOR 1-2-3 HIGH	NOTES
Building(s) Evaluation			
1. Neighborhood	7	2	Located Within Village Limits/Municipal Sewer & Water
2. Site Size	8	3	8-9 Acres With Growth Potential
3. Street Parking	5	1	Available on Hwy. 42 But Not Desirable
4. On-Site Parking	7	3	122 w/Handicapped-Good Ratio of Spaces to Seating Capacity
5. Usable Ancillary Buildings			
6. Rectory	6	1	Parish Office-Needs Some Updating-Sufficient to Meet Current Parish Needs-Built in 1922
7. Convent	N/A		
8. Hall/Gym	N/A		
9. School	N/A		
10. History	7	2	Built in 1908-Long Presence in Egg Harbor Community
11. Church (Capacity)	6	3	Approx. 200-Frequently Beyond Capacity During Summer and Fall
12. Basement	7	1	Finished w/Kitchen Functions as Parish Hall
13. ADA Accessibility	3	3	No Accessibility to Basement Restrooms-Not Compliant
14. Condition of Church	8	2	Very Good-Renovated in 1992/Roof Replaced in 1990
15. Architectural Character	8	2	Stone Exterior-Prominent Building in Community
16. Addition Potential	6	3	Sufficient Room to Expand Church if Needed in Future
17. Alternate Use Adaptability #	3	2	Limited But Could See Some Possible Tourist Related Use
Liturgical Factors			
L1. Participatory Accessibility	5	3	Altar/Sanctuary Not Accessible/Need To Make Accommodations
L2. Liturgical Accommodation	8	3	Very Good
L3. Vatican II Adaptability	9	3	Very Good
L4. Sacramental Needs	8	3	Adequate Sacristy
L5. Ministry Needs	3	3	Not Adequate Gathering Space, for Wakes, Funerals, Baptisms, General Fellowship/Outdoor Patio for Gathering

* Scale 1 to 10 (10 high)
 # Scale at 10 to 1 (1 high)

Facility Evaluation-St. Paul Parish (Fish Creek)

St. Paul Church was constructed in 1957. The church underwent a major expansion and renovation costing \$450,000 in 1992. There are no ancillary parish buildings as the parish has been served by a non-resident pastor since its inception.

37
According to the pastor, St. Paul is the smallest congregation of the five Northern Door parishes with only 30 family units. As such, it serves primarily visitors and tourists. Historically, St. Paul has had the highest mass attendance of any of the Northern Door churches and averages over 475 people per weekend during the summer months. Two masses are celebrated each weekend during the summer/tourist season and one mass is said during the remainder of the year. Even during the non-peak tourist part of the year, St. Paul's has averaged approximately 255 participants at each mass celebrated. ~~Because this is the largest church in Northern Door with approximately 500 seats, it is rare to reach the seating capacity at St. Paul's.~~ CAPACITY IS EXCEEDED (OR NEARLY SO) 12-15 TIMES PER YEAR

Site

St. Paul's Church occupies a very prominent location on Highway 42 within the central business district of the unincorporated area of the township of Gibraltar commonly referred to as Fish Creek. The parish owns approximately 4 acres of property, which is more than adequate for the church and parking areas.

114
There are 88 parking spaces on site with some additional street parking available on Highway 42. Based upon a seating capacity of 500, St. Paul's should have approximately 200 on site parking spaces to meet current standards for church parking (one parking stall per 2.5 seats). 20 SPACES

Church

St. Paul's is the second newest of the five churches evaluated. It is in excellent condition and the parish has evidenced good stewardship in the maintenance of its church building. The 1992 expansion and remodeling of the building significantly enhanced the church to meet and even exceed liturgical space factors.

St. Paul's is very open and inviting to liturgical participation. It has a small gathering space and kitchen on the north side of the building, which provides some opportunity for parishioner and visitor fellowship. While the size of the gathering space is not ideal given the seating capacity of the church, it still provides space for this important function.

St. Paul's Church probably has the best possible adaptive reuse of the churches evaluated (either by another congregation or for a commercial use) because of its excellent location, accessibility and expandability for both the building and parking. I would also state that it is probably the most valuable real estate of all the parish properties reviewed.



CHURCH NAME St. Paul City Fish Creek

Evaluator Kevin Brunner Date 9/11/02

ARCHITECTURAL BUILDING EVALUATION	RATING	IMPORTANCE FACTOR 1-2-3 HIGH	37 NOTES
Building(s) Evaluation			Only 30 Family Units-Almost All Tourists/Other Parish Members
1. Neighborhood	7	2	Village of Fish Creek/Municipal Sewer/Water
2. Site Size	8	3	4 Acres-Adequate for Size of Congregation
3. Street Parking	5	1	Available on Hwy 42 (20 SPACES)
4. On-Site Parking	5	3	23 114 Stalls
5. Usable Ancillary Buildings			
6. Rectory			N/A
7. Convent			N/A
8. Hall/Gym			N/A
9. School			N/A
10. History	5	2	Built in 1957/Major Renovation in 1992
11. Church (Capacity)	8	3	500 - Capacity - Meets Seasonal Demands Well
12. Basement			N/A
13. ADA Accessibility	7	3	Accessible Rest Rooms
14. Condition of Church	9	2	Excellent
15. Architectural Character	6	2	
16. Addition Potential	6	3	Expandable Parking/Building Has Some Expansion Potential
17. Alternate Use Adaptability #	7	2	Potential Commercial Use
Liturgical Factors			
L1. Participatory Accessibility	7	3	One Step to Altar (HANDICAP RAMP AVAILABLE)
L2. Liturgical Accommodation	8	3	Very Good
L3. Vatican II Adaptability	9	3	Very Good
L4. Sacramental Needs	8	3	Small Baptistry (Altar)
L5. Ministry Needs	7	3	Working and Vesting Sacristy

* Scale 1 to 10 (10 high)
Scale at 10 to 1 (1 high)

Small Kitchen/Gathering Area 100+
North Side of Building

Facility Evaluation-St. Michael's Church (Jacksonport)

According to diocesan records, St. Michael's Church was constructed in 1890. Aside from normal maintenance of the structure, there have been no major alterations or remodeling of the church since its construction. The last major maintenance performed on the church building was the installation of aluminum siding in 1980.

In 1993, a modular building comprising approximately 1600 square feet was placed on the St. Michael's site to serve as a small parish center. The building is used for religious education and parish meetings and also contains bathrooms and a small kitchen to serve the adjacent church. The parish spent \$65,000 for this modular building and also invested \$26,000 in 1994 for the asphalt paving of the small parking lot that serves the church and parish center.

According to the pastor, St. Michael's has approximately 80 families. ^{ONE MASS IS} ~~Two masses are~~ celebrated each weekend during the summer/tourist season and one mass is celebrated during the remainder of the year. Frequently, during the summer/tourist season the church seating capacity of 150 is exceeded with participants standing outside the church building.

Site

St. Michael's sits on approximately ^{3.5} ~~six~~ acres of land, which includes the parish cemetery lying immediately east of the church and parish center. The property is located on Highway 57 and is south of the unincorporated town of Jacksonport approximately one and one half miles.

The parish property has frontage along Lake Michigan and as such is very valuable. Due to the parish cemetery's location, it would be difficult, nor likely would it be desirable, to subdivide the Lake Michigan frontage property for potential residential land use.

Paved on-site parking is not adequate as there are only 17 spaces (with designated handicapped) available. There are seven designated parking spaces along Highway 57. As such, parking primarily takes place on the grassy area to the north of the church and along the gravel roadway that serves the cemetery.

A good standard for church parking is one parking stall per 2.5 seats so the parish should have approximately 60 parking stalls on site.

Church

St. Michael's Church is a wood frame construction with aluminum siding. The condition of the church building is very poor. This is evidenced by a severe warping of the wood floor (this is rather evident when walking down the center aisle); a roof in serious need of repair/replacement and worn/dated furnishings. I also question the structural stability of the choir loft.

